

JENNER & BLOCK

*Practice Series*

# Sanctions Under Rule 11

Jerold S. Solovy

Norman M. Hirsch

Margaret J. Simpson

Christina T. Tomaras

## Table of Contents

I. Introduction .....	1
A. Supreme Court Cases Involving Rule 11 .....	1
B. Scope of Outline.....	2
C. History of Rule 11 .....	3
II. Private Securities Litigation Reform Act of 1995.....	6
III. Text of Rule 11 .....	17
IV. Rule 11(a) .....	20
A. What Must Be Certified: The Reach of Rule 11 .....	21
B. Who Must Certify.....	21
C. Required Statements.....	21
D. Consequences of Not Certifying.....	22
V. Rule 11(b) .....	22
A. Contents of the Certificate .....	23
B. Objective Standard .....	23
1. Frivolousness Test .....	24
2. Purpose of Objective Test.....	26
C. Reasonable Inquiry.....	27
1. Affirmative Duty of Inquiry.....	27
2. Requirement to Specifically Identify Lack of Evidentiary Support .....	32
3. Different Language for Factual Contentions and Denials .....	32
4. Reasonableness of Inquiry .....	33
(a) Time Available for Investigation.....	39
(b) Availability of Evidence.....	40
(1) All evidence in client's hands must be reviewed.....	40
(2) Evidence in the opponent's exclusive control.....	40
(c) Reliance upon Client's Statements.....	43
(d) Consultation with the Client.....	45
(e) Reliance upon Other Attorneys .....	46
(f) Responsibilities of Pro Se Litigants.....	47
(g) Attorney's Inexperience .....	50
(h) Inadvertent Factual Errors.....	51

D. Warranted by Law.....	52
1. Warranted by Existing Law .....	53
(a) Filing Need Not Ultimately Prevail.....	56
(b) Dismissal of Action.....	57
2. Not Warranted by Existing Law .....	59
(a) Adhering to Position After Court’s Warning .....	59
(b) Sanctions for Filing a Frivolous Summary Judgment Motion .....	61
(c) Assertion Contrary to Settled Precedent.....	62
(d) Advocating Legal Positions Where Issue Is Of First Impression in the Circuit .....	65
(e) Advocating Position Rejected by Circuit Court, but Accepted By Other Courts.....	66
(f) Asserting a Claim with Clear Procedural or Jurisdictional Defects.....	67
3. Warranted by a Nonfrivolous Argument for a Change of Law .....	69
(a) Argument Rejected in the Past .....	70
(b) Duty of Candor in Arguing for Change of Law .....	71
E. Improper Purpose .....	74
1. Harassment.....	76
2. Delay .....	79
3. Other Improper Purposes.....	80
4. Filing a Well-Founded Complaint for Improper Purpose.....	83
F. Piecemeal Evaluation of Papers.....	86
VI. Rule 11(c) .....	87
A. Notice and Reasonable Opportunity to Respond .....	88
1. “Safe Harbor” Provision .....	88
2. Due Process Requirements .....	96
B. Court May Impose a Sanction.....	99
C. Who May Be Sanctioned.....	100
1. Attorneys.....	101
(a) Certifying Attorney .....	101
(b) Local Counsel.....	102
(c) Former Counsel .....	102
(d) Substitute Counsel.....	103
2. Parties.....	103
(a) Represented Parties .....	103
(b) Pro Se Litigants .....	105

- (c) Sovereign Immunity Problem When United States Violates Rule 11 .....109
    - 3. Allocation of Sanctions Between Party and Attorney .....110
      - (a) Joint and Several Liability.....111
      - (b) Insurability of Sanctions.....112
        - (1) Duty to Defend.....113
        - (2) Duty to Indemnify .....114
      - (c) Attorney-Client and Work Product Privileges and Other Ethical Considerations .....116
  - D. Who May Seek Sanctions .....119
  - E. District Court Practice .....120
    - 1. Sanctions Initiated by Motion.....120
    - 2. Sanctions on Court’s Initiative.....121
    - 3. The Nature of Sanctions and Limitations on Sanctions.....123
      - (a) Discouraging Monetary Awards.....123
      - (b) Nonmonetary Sanctions .....128
      - (c) No Sua Sponte Sanctions Proceeding May Be Instituted After a Case Is Settled or Voluntarily Dismissed.....131
    - 4. Requirements for the Sanctions Order.....132
    - 5. Obligation to Mitigate.....133
    - 6. Timing of a Rule 11 Motion .....135
    - 7. Magistrate Judges.....137
    - 8. Discovery .....138
    - 9. Sanctions for Filing a Frivolous Sanctions Motion .....139
    - 10. Motion for Reconsideration .....140
- VII. Rule 11(d).....141
- VIII. Appellate Procedure.....142
  - A. Appellate Jurisdiction .....142
    - 1. Appealability.....142
    - 2. Standing .....146
    - 3. Notice of Appeal .....147
  - B. Standard of Review .....149
  - C. Selection of Sanction on Appeal .....151
  - D. Applicability of Rule 11 to Conduct in Appellate Proceedings.....151
  - E. Fees on Appeal .....152

IX. Reach of Rule 11 .....	155
A. Any Paper.....	155
B. Papers Prior to Litigation .....	159
C. Other Sanctions Provisions .....	159
D. Standing to Seek Sanctions.....	161
E. Substantive Private Right of Action.....	161
F. State Court Proceedings.....	162
G. Criminal Proceedings.....	164
H. Administrative Proceedings .....	165
I. Jurisdiction.....	165
J. Impact of Rules Enabling Act .....	168

Appendix I: Rule 11 and the Advisory Committee Notes

Appendix II: 1991 Bench-Bar Proposal for Amending Rule 11

Appendix III: Private Securities Litigation Reform Act of 1995 and Conference Committee Report – Provisions Relevant to Rule 11